



California Children and Families Commission Meeting

August 22, 2024

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES

Item 1 – Opening Remarks

Chair Albright called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m.

Commissioners Present: Katie Albright
 Elsa Jimenez
 Vivian Velasco Paz
 Jackie Majors
 Lori Risso (joined virtually)
 Amy Bernardino-Fabi

Ex Officio Member Present: No one appointed at this time.

Commissioners Absent: Shana Hazan joined the meeting at 9:31 a.m.

Land Acknowledgments

Elder Diana Martinez from the San Pasqual Band of Mission Indians opened the meeting with a Tribal Land Acknowledgment.

Chair Announcements

Chair Albright began her remarks by thanking First 5 San Diego Executive Director Alethea Arguilez and her staff, the San Diego County Administration Center, and Vice Chair Hazan, for hosting First 5 California (F5CA) and their assistance with the logistics for today's meeting and roundtable discussion yesterday.

Chair Albright highlighted a few points of order including:

1. Director Wong will provide opening remarks and conduct a review of the agenda, including points of emphasis for Commissioners and the public, and to highlight the focus of today's meeting.
2. Traditionally, the Advisory Committee Reports were brought up in Item 1. Instead, Advisory Committee Reports were combined with their corresponding Item on the agenda. This allowed Committee members to provide important insights from their

respective advisory committees regarding the agenda items discussed in their committees.

3. To allow our partners at the First 5 Association ample time on the agenda to present their item, Item 11, First 5 Association Emergency Stabilization Funding Request, was moved to after Item 5.

First 5 California Executive Director Report

Director Wong began her remarks by sharing that F5CA's work is rooted in attaining the North Star and Audacious Goal. The upcoming strategic plan is focused on charting the path to achieve both and we will receive an update on the progress of this plan, as well as our strategy for engaging stakeholders. F5CA's site visit yesterday focused on learning first-hand the differences between refugees, asylum seekers, and F5CA's role. Director Wong shared that the Program and Evaluation Advisory Committee and staff will provide a data update on investments in refugee populations. Director Wong also shared F5CA has invited Children First Collective San Diego to talk about their work.

Director Wong shared the following goals for the meeting:

1. Obtain approval for items in the Consent Calendar, fund a Public Relations proposal, and move the October Commission Meeting date.
2. Hear updates from Commission Advisory Committee members and staff on F5CA program and research projects, revenue and balances related to the Financial Plan, and status of the new Strategic Plan.

First 5 Association Executive Director Report

Avo Makdessian, Executive Director of the First 5 Association (Association), shared that the Association is evaluating and assessing their strategic plan since it was created at a time that's much different than today. Mr. Makdessian stated the Association would like to engage the Commission on what the restructuring looks like and where the Association fits in as a whole network. Mr. Makdessian shared the Association will also be looking at the diversity, equity, and inclusion work. Mr. Makdessian stated the Association is closely tracking Proposition 1 on the new transformative implementation of the Mental Health Services Act.

Partner Presentation

Director Wong introduced Alethea Arguilez, Executive Director of First 5 San Diego. Director Arguilez gave a warm welcome to all. Director Arguilez shared she is honored F5CA invited the Children First Collective San Diego and is a proud member. Director Arguilez shared that the Collective is a grassroots coalition that came together on behalf of children and families prior to the pandemic. Director Arguilez expressed her appreciation to the First 5 Association as a statewide network and for coming together and joining arms on behalf of children and families statewide.

Courtney Baltiyskyy and the Children First Collective San Diego team shared a detailed PowerPoint presentation. Highlights included:

- Current state of child care in San Diego
- The Collective's Focus Areas
- Facilities - Child Care Centers and Homes in the Mixed Delivery System
- Mental and Behavioral Health Supports for Children and their Caregivers
- Local Government Infrastructure that Supports Children and Families
- Innovative and Exciting Work to Support Babies, Young Children, and their Families in San Diego

Chair Albright thanked the Collective for an incredible presentation. Chair Albright shared F5CA will post all materials to the F5CA website. Chair Albright stated it appears San Diego is a model for leveraging incredible work for families, and funding and creating solutions that bring change. Vice Chair Hazan expressed her appreciation for so many entities coming together and focusing on systems change and to think about the work across the State and how F5CA can support and build capacity within local organizations to build sustainable local sources of funding to drive change and support families and children.

Item 2 – Public Comment

Lera Radd, Vice President of Sales, The Discovery Source: Ms. Radd shared The Discovery Source is a solution-based company in San Diego. Ms. Radd introduced the Baby Home Start and Home Start materials available in any language that encourage conversations between parents, caregivers and their children from birth. Ms. Radd shared The Discovery Source hopes the Commission will consider sharing the materials with other parent resource materials.

Action Item 3 – Consent Calendar

MOTION/ACTION: Vice Chair Hazan moved to approve the Consent Calendar. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Jimenez.

VOTE: The motion was unanimously approved by the Commission.

Information Item 4 – Strategic Plan Update

Director Wong stated F5CA is fine tuning the Strategic Plan process, engaging the Commission and providing updates regarding the Strategic Plan. Director Wong deferred to Arabella Advisors to present the update.

Arabella Advisors provided a PowerPoint presentation. Highlights included:

Strategic Plan Process Update

- Organizing the Framework
- Collecting External Feedback
- Next Steps

Discussion

Vice Chair Hazan stated she would like to focus on outcomes and then work through the catalyst, advocate, convener and broadcaster elements.

Chair Albright suggested that F5CA focus on what the outcomes and indicators are within the catalyst, advocate, convener, and broadcaster roles.

Commissioner Jimenez indicated that timelines would help to frame sub goals and progress made. Director Wong stated indicators and dashboards are consistently being measured to ensure they have the intended impact.

Vice Chair Hazan stated that given the Audacious goal, the commission should consider what the short-term goals would be at the end of a specified term. What would the commission want to be different for kids and how the commission know it is on track to achieving the Audacious Goal as outlined in the Strategic Plan.

Commissioner Majors stated information, tangible goals, and outcomes are missing. Commissioner Majors reiterated the Commission's commitment to focusing on outcomes.

Commissioner Jimenez stated the sub goals should state what activity or action, we as a Commission will take in the areas of catalyst, advocate, convener, and broadcaster and the next step would be to see if there are outcomes or indicators that the Commission can strive to achieve based on the Commission's role and are those the right set of goals.

Vice Chair Hazan stated understanding which investments and activities are tied to which outcomes is important.

Commissioner Fabi shared what's missing is F5CA's accomplishments and current investments and include those as part of the outcomes and indicators.

Commissioner Risso stated F5CA needs to solidify and figure out what the overall mission is and how is the Commission going to get there. Commissioner Majors stated what's missing is the child care crisis and what F5CA is going to do either as an advocate or a broadcaster.

Public Comment

Courtney Armstrong, Director of Government Affairs, First 5 Association: Ms. Armstrong stated Proposition 10 authorizes all of us to be here to create a statewide, integrated, comprehensive and collaborative system, to enhance early childhood development and

that language should be reflected in the Strategic Plan. Ms. Armstrong shared the Association feels meaningful involvement with the counties is critically important.

Sarina Lynn: Ms. Lynn shared F5CA could be a true champion for the direct service provider. Ms. Lynn stated without promoting the workforce and early educators, you can't increase access to quality preschool programs or early education programs

Heidi Mendenhall, Executive Director, Tehama County: Ms. Mendenhall stated in rural areas, counties have little to no direct services. Ms. Mendenhall appreciates the ability to utilize local commissions to integrate direct services into systems. Ms. Mendenhall feels the word co-create will be valuable to the Strategic Plan process.

Information Item 5 – Financial Update

Commissioner Jimenez shared staff provided an update to the Fiscal and Audits Advisory Committee in a meeting held on July 1, 2024, between F5CA and the Association to obtain clarity on the emergency stabilization funding proposal. Commissioner Jimenez stated the Committee discussed how to collectively stimulate interest for further investments in the early childhood space and will be an ongoing discussion. Commissioner Jimenez stated staff provided the May Revise projections to be presented in August 2024.

Marcia Thomas, Director of Fiscal Services, provided a recap of the May 2024 Budget Study Session. Highlights included:

- Flow of Projections
- Statutory Revenue Distribution by Account
- Statutory Fund Definitions
- How to read the Fund Condition Summary
- Sources of Revenue
- Funding Structure
- Factors that Impact Revenue

Dr. Angelo Williams highlighted that the additional flavor ban on menthol cigarettes proposal would have a potential negative financial impact on an already declining revenue stream.

Public Comment

Avo Makdessian, Executive Director, First 5 Association: Mr. Makdessian stated there are a lot of unknowns regarding the flavor ban bill and the Association has not taken a position on the bill at this time.

Information Item 11 – First 5 Association Emergency Stabilization Funding Request

Avo Makdessian, Executive Director of the First 5 Association, and Fabiola González, Executive Director of First 5 Fresno, provided a PowerPoint presentation on the request for monetary stabilization from F5CA. Highlights included:

- Why funding is needed now
- Stabilization Request and Purpose
- Why F5CA for this request
- Recent timeline of engagement with F5CA
- Possible funding categories
- Distribution considerations
- Guiding principles
- Requests from Commission today

Discussion

Commissioner Paz asked if the \$25 million stabilization fund would be a competitive grant awarded to those counties that are most in need. Mr. Makdessian stated because of finite resources the allocation formula needs to be determined to identify how much each county can apply for.

Commissioner Jimenez asked what would be different a year from now that would ensure stability of the counties. Mr. Makdessian stated the expectation is it would allow time for future planning for additional resources and sustainability.

Commissioner Majors asked what has held the Association back from having this plan for additional resources and sustainability. Mr. Makdessian stated due to proposition 31, there has been a financial emergency over the last two and a half fiscal years and has forced counties to focus on supporting their communities with 20% less dollars and not the long-term sustainability issues.

Commissioner Majors asked if there may be untapped resources and opportunities within the communities following the \$25 million infusion to explore those opportunities. Mr. Makdessian stated it would provide time to explore opportunities and the Association is working with a consultant to look for other funding opportunities.

Commissioner Fabi asked what can be done with \$25 million when the original request was \$100 million. Mr. Makdessian stated the \$100 million dollar request was directly tied to revenue loss over the last two years to counties and is different from the community cuts that are taking place.

Chair Albright asked how the \$25 million is tied to long term sustainability. Mr. Makdessian stated the stabilization fund would be a lift to longer sustainable solutions that have yet to be defined and buy the counties time.

Vice Chair Hazan asked what would make the most impact with the use of the funds. Mr. Makdessian stated one of the principles of the “how” is to be community driven and

what stability means for every county. Mr. Makdessian stated the proposal would open the opportunity for each county to describe what stability means for them and have a common theme emerge around sustainability planning that is agreed to with the Commission.

Vice Chair Hazan stated it feels that the discussion was stabilization versus sustainability and wondering if combining two different things into one request would make more sense. Mr. Makdessian stated he would like to bring that perspective to their membership.

Commissioner Jimenez asked if the Association has done an analysis in terms of the counties most at risk. Mr. Makdessian stated the Association has performed a fund balance to revenue analysis. Commissioner Jimenez asked how many of the 58 counties are most at risk. Mr. Makdessian stated the average county has a little over two years.

Commissioner Fabi stated F5CA is already working on stabilization for the counties. Mr. Makdessian stated there are programmatic investments that are very specific and not focused on stability, infrastructure, leveraging or long-term planning. Mr. Makdessian stated stabilizing small counties is F5CA's number one equity investment and the formula hasn't changed in decades even though costs have gone up. Mr. Makdessian stated the Association is working on addressing changes in small population county augmentation.

Director Wong stated the formula was changed four years ago, in collaboration with First 5 counties, to a three-year grant with a one-year extension. Mr. Makdessian stated all counties are leveraging their dollars through philanthropy and other means. Mr. Makdessian stated counties are having to twist their way into creating a full program for a community. Commissioners expressed their appreciation to all the counties and shared a consensus to work with the Association. Commissioners agreed there are more questions and analysis to be done by the Fiscal and Audits Advisory Committee.

Letters of Support

Eloise Gómez Reyes, Majority Leader District 50 – Assembly California Legislature
Gail Pellerin, Assemblymember District 28 – Assembly California Legislature
Brian Boyer, Program Manager – Community Action Agency of Butte County, Inc.
Brian Pacheco, Supervisor District 1 – County of Fresno Board of Supervisors
Elishia Hayes, Administrative Officer – County of Humboldt Administrative Office,
Kristin Spanos, Chief Executive Officer – First 5 Alameda County
Tim Clark, Executive Director – First 5 Lassen County
Erica D'Anis, Commission Chair – First 5 Mendocino County
Nicole Hinton, Executive Director – First 5 Modoc County
Melody Easton, Executive Director – First 5 Nevada County
Kimberly Goll, Chief Executive Officer – First 5 Orange County
Julie Gallelo, Executive Director – First 5 Sacramento

Wendy Wendt, Executive Director – First 5 San Luis Obispo
Angie Dillon-Shore, Executive Director – First 5 Sonoma
Cathy Tillman, Executive Director – First 5 Trinity
Sarah Garcia, Executive Director – First 5 Tuolumne
Petra Puls, Executive Director – First 5 Venture
Gina Daleiden, Executive Director – First 5 Yolo
Carrie Powers, Regional Program Manager – Northern Valley Catholic Social Service
Lorey Keele, Community Services Director – Redwood Community Action Agency
Louise F. Rogers, San Mateo First 5 Commissioner – San Mateo County Health
Susan Ellenberg, President District 4 – Santa Clara County Board of Supervisors
Jill Cox, Supervisor District 2 – Trinity County Board of Supervisors

Public Comment

- Alethea Arguilez, Executive Director – First 5 San Diego
- Townley Saye, Executive Director and Jenna Flesh – First 5 Mendocino
- Sandra Uribe, Deputy Director – First 5 Sonoma
- Anna Bauer, Executive Director – First 5 Butte
- Mary Ann Hansen, Executive Director – First 5 Humboldt
- Amy Travis, Executive Director – First 5 Kern
- Jennifer Kelleher Cloyd, Executive Director – First 5 Santa Clara
- Heidi Mendenhall, Executive Director – First 5 Tehama
- Monica Ramirez, Executive Director – First 5 Madera
- Nikki West, Executive Director – First 5 Mariposa
- Clarissa Ravelo, Executive Director – First 5 Kings
- Cathy Tillman, Executive Director – First 5 Trinity
- Petra Puls, Executive Director – First 5 Ventura
- Wendy Sims-Moten, Executive Director – First 5 Santa Barbara
- Karen Pautz, Executive Director – First 5 Siskiyou

Virtually via phone:

- Ana Apodaca – First 5 Alameda
- Heidy Kellison – Yolo Commissioner
- John Jones – Chair, Contra Costa Commission
- Erin Hogeboom – San Diego Every Child
- Jayma Shields – Mendocino County Provider (Family Resource Centers)
- Sarina Lynn – San Diego County
- Gareth Ashley - First 5 Contra Costa County Commissioner
- Nichole Arnold – Vice Chair F5 Yolo Commission
- Ginger Harlow, Executive Director – First 5 Colusa
- Kitty Lopez, Executive Director – First 5 San Mateo
- Garth Lewis – Yolo County Superintendent of Schools, F5 Commission
- Theresa Zighera, Executive Director – First 5 San Francisco
- Hugo Morales – First 5 Fresno Commissioner
- Amy Broadhurst, Executive Director – First 5 Alpine

- David Brody, Executive Director – First 5 Santa Cruz
- Gina Daleiden, Executive Director – First 5 Yolo
- Natalie Arroyo – Humboldt Commissioner
- Katie Rast – Director of Community Impact, San Diego Foundation
- Ericka Summers, Executive Director – First 5 Yuba
- Nina Alcaez, Director of Policy, Advocacy, & Communications – First 5 Monterey
- Lucas Frerichs – Yolo County Supervisor
- Sara Salazar – San Diego County
- Nicole Hinton, Executive Director – First 5 Modoc
- Michelle Stephens – Humboldt County Commissioner
- Candy Corcoran, Executive Director – First 5 Sierra
- Melody Easton, Executive Director – First 5 Nevada
- Shammy Karim, Executive Director – First 5 Stanislaus
- Wendy Wendt, Executive Director – First 5 San Luis Obispo

Information Item 6 – State and Federal Budget and Legislative Update

Jorge De La Cruz, Deputy Director of External and Governmental Affairs, stated it's crucial that F5CA's legislative agenda remain in line with F5CA's North star and Audacious Goal. F5CA will analyze every bill that F5CA supports or opposes based on ACE's, childcare development, education, healthcare, social services, welfare infrastructure public services, equity, inclusion and regulatory and legal matters that pertain to the 0 to 5 population in California.

Discussion

The update was tabled until the next Commission meeting due to time constraints.

Public Comment

None.

Information Item 7 – Program and Research Update

Dr. Martha Dominguez-Brinkley, Deputy Director of Program Innovation and Evaluation, provided a PowerPoint presentation. Highlights included:

- Status of Investments Flowchart
- Programmatic Updates
- Research Updates
- Hope, Resilience, and Vitality Study and Purpose
- Objectives and Key Results

Discussion

Vice Chair Hazan expressed her appreciation and focus on objectives and key results as a useful framework to evaluate impact and connecting it back to the initial strategic

planning conversation. Vice Chair Hazan encouraged F5CA to think about key results as specific, measurable outcomes that are indicators of progress towards objectives. Vice Chair Hazan stated more clarity is needed around what F5CA is best positioned to do, and how dollars have the greatest impact and doesn't feel that basic needs for families is F5CA's role. Vice Chair Hazan asked if F5CA is leaning on and leveraging the insights of our local communities and commissions for research and identifying best practices.

Chair Albright stated basic needs is a significant piece around family strengthening and the work of family resource centers and community family strengthening organizations. Chair Albright stated it would be interesting to see how those organizations are moving forward on building protective factors for families.

Public Comment

Saye Townley Executive Director, First 5 Mendocino: Ms. Townley thanked Dr. Dominguez-Brinkley for the data and hopes it will be used when considering the Stabilization Proposal.

Heidi Mendenhall, Executive Director, First 5 Tehama: Ms. Mendenhall shared Tehama has been using the Whole Child model for the last three years and have been pleased with how to drive outcomes and action. Ms. Mendenhall stated Tehama is not the only county commission that uses a Whole Child model and there may be additional data to share to get a bigger picture.

Action Item 8 – Public Relations Campaign

Commissioner Majors provided an update on the Public Education and Outreach Advisory Committee that included the Cell-Ed program through Stronger Starts programming encouraging positive skills and great results were shared; the Fatherhood strategy is moving California's fathers into the position of helping deal with the issues of toxic stress; and the crisis around childcare affordability.

Dr. Williams provided a PowerPoint presentation. Highlights included:

- Snapshot of Progress to Date from Current PR Contract
- Raise CA Strong
- Paid Family Leave
- Brand Level Asset Creation
- Uplifting F5CA's Profile
- Advancing the ACES Conversation
- Team Building and Organization
- Recommendation for PR Contract
- Executive Summary

Discussion

Vice Chair Hazan requested clarification on the amount of money spent on past public relations campaign. Director Wong stated it has been one million annually. Dr. Williams stated this proposal was a little bit more than a million because of the intractable nature of the issue. Vice Chair Hazan asked if F5CA has engaged the Association and counties in identifying this specific issue and focus on shared work. Commissioner Majors stated the investment is meant to leverage F5CA's voice with local entities and to move public will around investment in early care, education, and childcare. Commissioner Paz asked if the campaign tools would be available for counties to customize according to their local needs. Dr. Williams stated yes, the campaign is built for coalition work at the local level. Director Wong stated when the campaign was started F5CA did reach out to counties and beyond F5's to collaborate. The Commission's consensus is to identify how F5CA's public relations efforts could potentially affect real change and ensure efforts are not duplicated.

Public Comment

Avo Makdessian, Executive Director, First 5 Association: Mr. Makdessian stated the public will is there and it's a matter of money. Mr. Makdessian stated the counties, and the Association have questions around who the targeted audience is. Mr. Makdessian stated there is a lot of work being done in the childcare space and asked what the added value this investment brings.

Scott Waite, Executive Director, First 5 Merced: Mr. Waite acknowledged the importance of childcare and that it has historically been the number one monetary issue. Mr. Waite stated the campaign doesn't clearly outline roles and responsibilities. Mr. Waite stated the Commission has tabled other projects because of lack of clarity and why isn't this being tabled for lack of clarity. Mr. Waite stated there are other things besides public relations that take place in the childcare world that counties need help informing the legislature and the public. Mr. Waite encouraged the Commission to think about the process for items outlined earlier in the meeting.

Fabiola González, Executive Director, First 5 Fresno: Ms. González asked what success would look like after an investment of \$4 million dollars that is focused on stakeholders and governmental officials when there is wide recognition of the childcare issue. Ms. González hopes the Commission will consider the question before moving forward.

MOTION/ACTION: No motion was made on this item.

Item 9 – October Commission Meeting Date Change

Chair Albright informed the Commissioners that the October 24, 2024, Commission Meeting needed to be changed due to scheduling conflicts. Because that date was already approved, the Commission needed a motion to cancel that meeting and reschedule to a later date.

Discussion

None

Public Comment

None.

MOTION/ACTION: Vice Chair Hazan moved to approve to change the October Commission Meeting to a later date. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Jimenez.

VOTE: The motion was unanimously approved by the Commission.

Item 10 – Review Commission and Advisory Committee Meeting Cadence

The update was tabled until the next Commission meeting due to time constraints.

Discussion

None.

Public Comment

None.

CLOSED SESSION

The Commission met during Closed Session. No action was taken.

Item 12 – Adjournment

Chair Albright adjourned the meeting at 4:40 p.m.